



MINIS
REPUBLIC OF ALBANIA
MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE



ACCREDITATION AGENCY FOR HIGHER EDUCATION

Address:

Accreditation Agency for Higher Education
Rruga "Lekë Dukagjini" Nr 5
Tirana - Albania

Tel/Fax: +355 4 257 954 / 266 302

Email: aahe_aaal@adanet.com.al
Web: www.aaal.edu.al

**“Aspects and Indicators
for Quality Evaluation
in Higher Education”**

PREAMBLE

The bulk of reforms undertaken at Higher Education level are intended to adjust Higher Education in our country to the most appropriate requirements and the best European standards in line with the Bologna Process. To be sure, Quality Assurance at Higher Education constitutes one of the main pillars of this reform, which is otherwise referred to as “*the heart of the setting up of the European Higher Education Area*”.(Berlin 2003)

In our country, the responsible institutions for maintaining Quality Assurance at Higher Education comprise the Evaluation and Accreditation System (Accreditation Agency on Higher Education –AAHE and the Accreditation Council –AC) in cooperation with the Ministry of Education and Science (MOES) and the Higher Education Institutions (HEIs).

The Accreditation Agency on Higher Education has as its main task and duty to evaluate Quality at Higher Education at the institutional and/or program level. Each evaluation process consists of two main stages: internal evaluation, which is carried out by the staff of Higher Education Institutions themselves, and the External Evaluation which is realized by an external team of experts for HEI under evaluation. This process should be acted upon in compliance with the requirements, procedures and guidelines drafted by the AAHE and approved by the AC. In the course of this process, the evaluation teams should describe the structure and/or programs to be evaluated and

write up the evaluation report on the basis of the criteria and guidelines in question.

The material presented in this booklet titled “*Aspects and Indicators for Quality Evaluation in Higher Education*”, compiled by AAHE in close collaboration with representatives of several HEI, serves as a guide and helping manual to the evaluation teams not only in the course of the evaluation process and the gathering of data, but also during the stage of writing up the evaluation reports.

In the first part of the booklet “*Aspects and sub-aspects for Quality Evaluation in Higher Education*” an account is rendered in some detail on all of the aspects and sub-aspects to be evaluated and described in the form of an evaluation report, while in the second half of the booklet titled “*Measurable indicators for Quality Evaluation in Higher Education*”, tables to be filled in with measurable data are brought in, which are to serve as quantitative indicators for the best part of the evaluation aspects and sub-aspects.

Never failing to take note of the fact that Quality at Higher Education is secured in the first by the Higher Education Institutions, the material presented in this booklet will serve as a guide and manual to the institutions in order for them to set the initial elements for their Internal Evaluation and monitoring process, as a first step towards setting up the Internal Systems of Quality Assurance at the Higher Education Institutions across the country.

DHURATA BOZO



Director of AAHE

PART ONE

MAIN ASPECTS OF EVALUATION IN HIGHER EDUCATION

- 1. Mission and objectives of an Higher Education Institution, program and curricula etc.**
- 2. Organizational structure of HEI, their constituent units and their management process;**
- 3. Analysis of courses of study, diplomas and MSc etc;**
- 4. Study programs, curricula organization, credits;**
- 5. Teaching and administrative staff;**
- 6. Teaching;**
- 7. Scientific research;**
- 8. Undergraduates and graduates (clients);**
- 9. Facilities, material resources, logistics base and other services delivered to community;**
- 10. Financing and managing financial resources;**
- 11. Internal system of Quality Assurance;**
- 12. National, international cooperation and relations with the public and labor market.**

SUB-ASPECT OF EVALUATION IN HIGHER EDUCATION

I. Mission and goals of any Higher Education Institution (HEI), of a program and curricula etc:

- a) Aims and goals of teaching and scientific research;
- b) Short-term, medium-term and long-term strategies for achieving the set goals ;
- c) In what way do the HEI pursue the changes happening at the counterpart institutions at the national and international level;
- d) How does HEI change in terms of its improvement, in compliance with the new requirements and how does it respond to the circumstances or the demands imposed from outside;
- e) Who checks on the above mechanisms;
- f) The overall data of a HEI are the following :
 - i) Background Information of HEI ;
 - ii) Statute of HEI in the national context;

- iii) Number of employees, teaching, support and administrative staff;
- iv) Number of students;
- v) Number of courses at the bachelor level (bachelor);
- vi) Number of courses at the master level (master);
- vii) Number of courses at the post-university level (doctorial);
- viii) Forms of the continuous qualification;
- ix) Place that HEI occupies in the context of national HE System;
- x) Place that HEI occupies at international context;
- g) Relevant documentation.

2. Organizational structure of HEI, of its constituent units and their management

- a) Organizational scheme of HEI , hierarchical organization;
- b) Policy and decision-making;
- c) Bodies selected at all levels;
- d) Faculties, departments, divisions;
- e) Number of leading, teaching, support, administrative staff for each unit;

- f) Quality of leading, teaching, support and administrative staff of each single unit;
- g) Competences and responsibilities, getting to know them;
- h) Work contracts, getting to know the rights and duties;
- i) Database of HEI, updating and the responsibility for retaining and sharing information;
- j) Relevant documentation;

3. Analysis of the study courses, diplomas, courses and postuniversity courses etc.

- a) Didactic structure in general, diplomas issued;
- b) Didactic structure for department and course of study;
- c) Statistics on admission for each course of study, the number of candidate applicants, number of those admitted, the quality level of those admitted;
- d) Number of students per each course of study;
- e) Number of teaching staff for each course of study: full-time and part-time staff;

- f) Number of support teaching staff for each course of study;
- g) Passing rate: number of students at entry (input) and exit points (output);
- h) Quality of passing: average grade;
- i) Coordination among courses of study;
- j) Relevant documentation;

4. Study programs, organization of curricula, credits

- a) The starting point, aims and objectives for each study program;
- b) Programs for each course of study, subjects and teaching load for each subject;
- c) Study programs with the respective teaching load for each professor;
- d) Number of terms and subjects for each study program;
- e) Place occupied by every subject in the study program, fitting subjects and teaching load of subject in the overall study program;
- f) Form of teaching every subject, ratios among and between them according to the specifics of subject and overall study program;
- g) Literature for each subject and its quality;

- h) Transferring of European Credit System (ECTS); teaching load in credit points in and outside the auditorium;
- i) Relevant documentation .

5. Teaching and support staff

- a) Structure of teaching and support staff in the curricula of every course of study;
- b) Number of full-time staff in the past five years;
- c) Ratio between the teaching staff and number of students for every course of study;
- d) Covering each subject with university teachers; number of university teachers; number of program tracks, teaching load;
- e) Distribution of teaching load across subjects of any given course of study;
- f) Engagement of teaching staff in courses of study outside the employment structure;
- g) Recruitment policy of staff in implementation of regulations in effect;
- h) Recruitment documentation, folders of hired staff
- i) Qualification scale of main staff and compatibility with the tasks they perform;

- j) Ratio between qualified staff and unqualified staff;
- k) Ratio between full-time staff and part-time staff;
- l) Qualification scale of part-time professorship and recruitment criteria in place;
- m) Average age of teaching staff and ratio between males and females;
- n) Support staff: hiring, work load, quality and its control;
- o) Relevant documentation

6. Teaching

- a) Organization and form of teaching: ratio between the two;
- b) Teaching load;
- c) Quality of teaching;
- d) Knowledge checkup; form of check-up, objectivity and evaluation of students;
- e) Number of students (entry) in the past five years;
- f) Number of students exiting university for each course of study (number of graduating students);
- g) Average duration of study;

- h) Passing rate for each exam season and for each course of study;
- i) Number of students entering post-university studies;
- j) Admission criteria to post-university schools, how are they being applied?
- k) Number of students completing post-university studies (post-university schools of a new nature);
- l) Number of doctoral studies in the past five years;
- m) Methods and technique, and technologies in teaching;
- n) Using new teaching technologies: computers, audio-visual means;
- o) Internal check on teaching.
- p) Relevant documentation

7. Scientific research

- a) Policies of scientific research at all of HEI ;
- b) Number of publications in the past five years from the steadily employed staff at HEI;
- c) Number of research projects obtained in the past five years;

- d) Number of projects implemented in the past five years;
- e) Participation of (HEI) staff in scientific activities at home and abroad;
- f) Number of scientific activities hosted by HEI during the past five years;
- g) Participation as partners in national or international projects;
- h) Organization of seminars with foreign lecturers, domestic or foreign ones;
- i) Training staff in the field of scientific research at home and abroad;
- j) Scientific infrastructure;
- k) Tying up scientific research with teaching process;
- l) Involvement of university students and graduates in scientific research;
- m) National or international awards (prizes) in the field of scientific research;
- n) Relevant documentation;

8. University students and graduates (clients)

- a) Policies and procedures for admitting students and graduate students: regulations, knowledge check-up, selection criteria,

transparency, statistics and relevant documentation.

- b) Teaching load of students in auditorium and outside it: credit system according to the years of study for each course of study;
- c) Graduating thesis: criteria, their completion, capacity of HEI ;
- d) Kinds of students' activities;
- e) Employing the newly graduated students" access to the labor market and their adaptability to this market;
- f) Informing students about their rights and duties, teaching programs, guiding manuals for courses of study;
- g) Inclusion of students in upgrading the programs, the teaching process and their representation in the governing structures of HEI ;
- h) Relevant documentation

9. Facilities, material resources, logistics, and other services to community

- a) Available spaces and other necessary assets needed in the realization of the teaching process: lecturing halls, labs, materials and

- other equipment necessary for theory and practice;
- b) Internet hook-up, computer equipment for both teachers and students;
- c) Libraries and their capacity compared to the number of staff and students;
- d) Covering other supplemental literature in many subjects from the stock of libraries or units (departments)
- e) The status of dormitories: ratio of space available with the number of students needed to be accommodated in them ;
- f) Other services available to students: study halls, photocopying, printing, information desk, staff delivering services;
- g) Other services offered to staff and students: sporting grounds, relaxing and entertaining etc.
- h) Other services for community: information, relations to public, services for the third parties.
- i) Relevant documentation

10. Financing and managing of financial resources

- a) Financing resources and statistics of the past five years;

- b) Utilization of financial resources and the scheme of finance used over the past five years;
- c) Expenditures for students and the costs of study per student for each academic year;
- d) Expenditures on teaching, scientific research, administration and equipments etc.
- e) Transparency and internal financial checkup. Auditing and results.
- f) Financial managing capacities;
- g) Relevant documentation

11. Internal system of Quality Assurance

- a) Internal control of quality
- b) Internal system of managing quality
- c) Responsibilities in monitoring and managing quality down to the department level;
- d) Self-evaluation and their results;
- e) Policy of bringing quality up one level on the basis of periodical evaluations
- f) Results of auditing and external evaluation
- g) Relevant documentation

12. National and international cooperation and relations with the public and the labor market

- a) National cooperation
 - i) Contacts and cooperation among HEI -s within the country and coordination of activities;
 - ii) Mobility of staff and students within the Higher Education System in the country;
 - iii) Communication and cooperation with other state and governmental institutions, professional associations, business community, labor market and other social actors as of importance to the higher Education.
 - iv) Keeping in touch with the graduated students and those freshly employed;
- b) International cooperation
 - i) Implementing objectives and activities in the context of Bologna Process;
 - ii) Contacts and cooperation with international analogue institutions;

- iii) Mobility of staff and students in counterpart institutions outside the country, exchanges among them;
 - iv) Participation in European programs (Cards, Tempus etc.) in the past five years;
 - v) Contacts and exchanges among students, specialized people and newly grads employed in counterpart institutions abroad
- c) Relations to the labor market
 - i) Establishing contacts and collecting data on students employed in the domestic public sector;
 - ii) Establishing contacts and collecting data on students employed in the private domestic sector;
 - iii) Contacts and collecting data on students employed abroad.
 - d) Relations with public and community on the whole;
 - e) Relevant documentation.

PART TWO

MEASURABLE INDICATORS FOR QUALITY EVALUATION IN HIGHER EDUCATION

I. TEACHING AND SUPPORT STAFF

I.1. Data on the unit personnel according to the categorization of personnel office

- Number of full-time teaching-scientific employees with a full work load;
- Number of full-time teaching-scientific employees with a reduced work load;
- Number of part time teaching-scientific employees
- Number of administrative and support staff (lab assistants, technicians, administrative staff etc)

I. 2. Data on the unit personnel according to the categorization of personnel office

I. 2. a. According to sex

- Number of full-time teaching-scientific staff M-F;
- Number of part time teaching-scientific staff M-F;
- Number of administrative and support staff (lab assistants, technicians, administrative staff etc) M-F, in each case.

I. 3. Data on distribution of full-time academic staff

I. 3.a. According to qualification

- Number of professors;
- Number of associated professors
- Number of doctoral degree holders
- Number of University teachers;
- Number of assistants

I. 3.b. According to sex:

- Number of professors M-F
- Number of associated professors M-F
- Number of doctoral degree holders M-F
- Number of University teachers M-F
- Number of assistants M-F

I.3. a. According to age

Staff and administrative	Age				
	25-35	35-45	45-55	55-65	65-68
Professors					
As. Prof.					
Doct.					
Ped.					
Assistans					
Administrative and support staff					

I. 4.Data on distribution of part-time academic staff

I. 4.a. According to qualification

- Number of professors;
- Number of associated professors
- Number of doctoral degree holders
- others

I.4.b. According to sex

- Number of professors M-F
- Number of associated professors M-F
- Number of doctoral degree holders M-F
- others

I.4.c. According to age

Accademic staff	Age					
	25-35	35-45	45-55	55-65	65-68	Mbi 68
Professors						
As. Prof.						
Doct.						
Others						

II. TEACHING

II.1. Work load of the full-time staff

Full-time staff	Number of staff whose teaching load is :					
	<100	110-200	200-300	300-400
Professors						
As.Prof.						
Ped.						
Doct.						
Others						

*Physical hours mean lectures, seminars, converted activities and other elements adding up to the work load.

11.1.a. Physical load of the part-time staff

Part-time staff	Number of staff load is:					
	<50	50-100	100-150	150-200
Professors						
As.Prof.						
Doct.						
others						

11.2. Overall teaching load

The overall load realized is expressed in terms of hours, in which case the term hour means just hour 45 minutes (hour per activity), according to all the elements of the load: distribution according to quantity and professorship.

11.2.a. Overall load of full-time staff *

Full-time staff	Number of staff whose teaching load is :								
	<100	110-200	200-300	300-400	400-500	500-600	600-700
Professors									
As.Prof.									
Ped.									
Doct.									
Others									

**Definition: full timer is considered the employee, who is engaged by the unit in the financial and administrative sense.*

11.2.b. Overall load of part-time staff *

Part-time staff	Number of staff whose teaching load is :								
	<50	50-100	100-200	200-300	300-400	400-500	500-600
Professors									
As.Prof.									
Doct.									
Others									

**Definition: part-time is considered the employee, who is not engaged in the unit in the financial and administrative sense.*

III. UNIVERSITY STUDIES

Amount of hours (work load) for which the unit is engaged in terms of all the elements of the workload (potential of hours).

III. I. Within the Unit*

No	Teaching activity	No. of staff		No. of stud.		Contact hours (45')		Teaching hr.	
		B	J	B	J	B	J	B	J
1.	Lectures								
2.	Parallel lectures								
3.	Seminars, Activities								
4.	Teaching and ped. pract.								
5.	Controlled Lab activities								
6.	Course (number)								
7.	Colloquiums								
8.	Consultation								
9.	Course assignment (no.)								
10.	Diploma guidance								
11.	Diploma review								
12.	Maturity tests								
13.	Test/test repetition								
14.	Exams a. Written or oral exam b. Written and oral exam								
	Total								
	Total								

* This table is filled out to assess the load of the unit according to its elements. It could be subject to changes on the basis of the eventual changes in the afore-mentioned elements of workload, yet the above elements serve to gauge the real load of the staff irrespective of the fact if they are elements of the standard teaching load.

III. 2. Outside the unit*

No	Teaching activity	No. of staff		No. of stud.		Contact hours (45')		Teaching hr.	
		B	J	B	J	B	J	B	J
1.	Lectures								
2.	Parallel lectures								
3.	Seminars, Activities								
4.	Teaching and ped. pract.								
5.	Controlled Lab activities								
6.	Course (number)								
7.	Colloquiums								
8.	Consultation								
9.	Course assignment (no.)								
10.	Diploma guidance								
11.	Diploma review								
12.	Maturity tests								
13.	Test/test repetition								
14.	Exams a. Written or oral exam b. Written and oral exam								
	Total								
	Total								

* This table is filled out to assess the load of the unit according to its elements. It could be subject to changes on the basis of the eventual changes in the afore-mentioned elements of workload, yet the above elements serve to gauge the real load of the staff irrespective of the fact if they are elements of the standard teaching load.

IV. Part-time studies

The amount of hours (workload) in which the unit is engaged, on the basis of all the elements of the load (potential of hours).

IV.1. Within the unit*

No	Teaching activity	No. of staff		No. of stud.		Contact hours (45')		Teaching hr.	
		B	J	B	J	B	J	B	J
1.	Lectures								
2.	Parallel lectures								
3.	Seminars, Activities								
4.	Teaching and ped. pract.								
5.	Controlled Lab activities								
6.	Course (number)								
7.	Colloquiums								
8.	Consultation								
9.	Course assignment (no.)								
10.	Diploma guidance								
11.	Diploma review								
12.	Maturity tests								
13.	Test/test repetition								
14.	Exams a. Written or oral exam b. Written and oral exam								
	Total								
	Total								

* This table is filled out to assess the load of the unit according to its elements. It could be subject to changes on the basis of the eventual changes in the afore-mentioned elements of workload, yet the above elements serve to gauge the real load of the staff irrespective of the fact if they are elements of the standard teaching load.

IV.2. Outside the unit *

No	Teaching activity	No. of staff		No. of stud.		Contact hours (45')		Teaching hr.	
		B	J	B	J	B	J	B	J
1.	Lectures								
2.	Parallel lectures								
3.	Seminars, Activities								
4.	Teaching and ped. pract.								
5.	Controlled Lab activities								
6.	Course (number)								
7.	Colloquiums								
8.	Consultation								
9.	Course assignment (no.)								
10.	Diploma guidance								
11.	Diploma review								
12.	Maturity tests								
13.	Test/test repetition								
14.	Exams a. Written or oral exam b. Written and oral exam								
	Total								
	Total								

* This table is filled out to assess the load of the unit according to its elements. It could be subject to changes on the basis of the eventual changes in the afore-mentioned elements of workload, yet the above elements serve to gauge the real load of the staff irrespective of the fact if they are elements of the standard teaching load.

IV.3. Potential of the hours within the unit (statutory potential and realization) distributed according to the nature of those in charge of realizing it (full-time, part-time) and the kind of the load.

Kind of study	No. of staff	The internal effectiveness of the unit		No of staff	Part-time Supl.	Total	
		According to load	Supl.			According to load	Supl.
Universt. studies							
K. e Pj							
Master							

V. SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH

1. Number of textbooks meant for students written by the staff or when the said textbooks enjoy co-authorship;
2. Number of textbooks published;
3. Number of articles published in scientific journals in the country;
4. Number of articles published in foreign scientific journals;
5. Number of scientific conferences within the country in which the papers have been presented:
 - a. Number of presentations
 - b. Number of posters
6. Number of scientific conferences outside the country in which the various papers have been presented:
 - a. Presentations:
 - b. Posters;
7. Number of participation in international conferences with no presentation;
8. Number of written reports for the intents of studies or research and filed with the interested institutions;
9. Number of scientific seminars that function per unit;
10. Number of scientific conferences within the country which are under the care of the unit or when the unit is a co-host to the event;
11. Number of scientific conferences outside the country in which the unit acts as a partner to the co-hosting of the event;
12. National projects

- a. Number of projects supported by the local government;
 - b. Number of projects with the support of government;
 - c. Number of projects with the support of the domestic and foreign organizations;
13. Number of the members of staff who have been abroad through qualification, cooperation and specialization programs.
14. Number of members of staff who have been engaged as an invited/teaching guest to teaching, seminars, in cooperation
- a. In universities and other academic institutions of the country;
 - b. In universities and other foreign academic institutions
15. Number of foreigners who have paid visits to units for purposes of teaching, research, and cooperation;
16. Number of training courses organized for other parties outside the Higher Education Institutions (on-going qualification).
17. Number of staff engaged in these training courses;
18. Number of members of academic staff who are members in professional organizations;
- a. country
 - b. international

VI. UNIVERSITY AND POST-UNIVERSITY STUDIES

VI.1. Students: data on students, depending on the level of study, university, master, doctoral studies and demographical data etc.

- Number of students enrolled in the first year;
- Number of students enrolled in the second year;
- Number of students enrolled in the third year;
- Number of students enrolled in the fourth year;
- Number of students enrolled in the master programs
- Number of students enrolled in doctoral studies

Out of the total:

- How many males/ how many females;
- How many Albanians, how many from the Albanian territories, how many foreigners;
- How many from the general high school and the school with a natural-technical study track (for the first year);
- How many from the general high school of the social study track (for the first year);
- How many from the vocational high school (for the first year);

- How many from the public school;
- How many from the private school;
- How many are entitled to a scholarship

Social status of students for every year of schooling

(An official classification should be used in this case)

VI. 2. Students: data on the outcomes of tests, for each year of schooling and for each level (number of students enrolled, number of tests, number of students entering exam, number of passing students, and number of students repeating a class)

- Number of students entering exams in the first year;
- Number of first year students moving on to the second year.
- Number of students entering exams in the second year;
- Number of first year students moving up to the third year.
- Number of students that enter exams in the third year;
- Number of first year students who move on to the fourth year;
- Number of students who graduate in the fourth year for each diploma.

VI.3. Students: number of candidates to be enrolled in study programs, number of those admitted;

- Number of candidates to enter into the first year
- How many **fs** and **ms** are there?
- How many from the public schools?
- How many from the private schools?
- Number of winners;

VI. 4. Graduation: number of students graduating at all levels, university, master, doctoral studies.

- Number of students graduating from a university program;
- Number of students enrolled in master programs
- Number of students enrolled in doctoral programs

VI. 5. Graduation: number of diplomas offered at the university, master, doctoral level

- Number of university diplomas offered;
- Number of “master” degrees offered;
- Number of doctoral degrees offered

VII. FACILITIES, MATERIAL RESOURCES, LOGISTICS AND OTHER SERVICES TOWARDS THE COMMUNITY

VII. 1. Information technology and units:

- number of PC per students;
- number of PC furnished labs per students;
- number of PC for academic staff
- number of PC for administration
- number of printers for each one
- number of photocopying machines for each one
- number of head projectors
- number of video-projectors
- number of scanners

VII. 2. Department space, space available for academic staff, expenditures on maintenance, investments.

SPACE	area m ²		Expenditure on maintenance, 000 leks		Investments 000 leks	
	Situation	Isrequested	Realized	Demanded	Realized	Requested
Labs						
Space for staff						
Space for teaching						
Total						

VIII. FINANCING AND MANAGING OF HUMAN RESOURCES

VIII. 1. Incomes and other funding in the past five years.

PUBLIC FUNDS:	Yr 1	Yr 2	Yr 3	Yr 4	Yr 5
Central government					
Local government					
Total					
Non-public funds:					
Grants on research and contracts					
Consultations, services					
All kinds of tuition fees					
Sponsorships					
Training services (on-going qualifications)					
Donations, service-rendering activities, foundations etc.					
Commercial activities (canteens, cafeterias, residential quarters)					
Total					
Total Sum					

VIII. 2. Expenditures in the past 5 yrs according to the financing source.

PUBLIC FUNDS	Yr 1			Yr 2			Yr 3		
	Salary	Expd.	invest	Salary	Expd.	invest	Salary	Expd.	invest
Central government									
Local government									
Total									
Non-public funds:									
Grants on research and contracts									
Consultations, services									
All kinds of tuition fees									
Sponsorships									
Training services (on-going qualifications)									
Donations, service-rendering activities, foundations etc.									
Commercial activities (canteens, cafeterias, residential quarters)									
Total									
<i>Total Sum</i>									

VIII. 2. Continues

PUBLIC FUNDS	Yr 4			Yr 5		
	Salary	Expd.	invest	Salary	Expd.	invest
Central government						
Local government						
Total						
Non-public funds:						
Grants on research and contracts						
Consultations, services						
All kinds of tuition fees						
Sponsorships						
Training services (on-going qualifications)						
Donations, service-rendering activities, foundations etc.						
Commercial activities (canteens, cafeterias, residential quarters)						
Total						
<i>Total Sum</i>						